




THE CITY OF SAN DIEGO  
M E M O R A N D U M

OFFICE OF THE INDEPENDENT BUDGET ANALYST

DATE: September 9, 2010

TO: Citizens' Revenue Review and Economic Competitiveness Commission

FROM: Lisa Byrne, Fiscal and Policy Analyst 

SUBJECT: Comparison of Refuse Collection Fees within San Diego County

---

Attached are two charts to assist the Commission in comparing solid waste rates in the County of San Diego. This memo will provide explanations for complexities embedded within the data of these two charts.

- "Solid Waste Rates Survey of the San Diego Region - July 2010," which was prepared by the City of Chula Vista.
- "Comparison of Refuse Collection Fees within San Diego County," which has been prepared by the IBA for the Citizens' Revenue Review and Economic Competitiveness Commission

Within the "Comparison of Refuse Collection Fees within San Diego County," amounts in the comparison rate and storm water fee columns are taken from the "Solid Waste Rates Survey of the San Diego Region - July 2010." The difference column is calculated based on those rates.

There are many variables in service levels and costs charged, making this type of comparison difficult. For example, some cities may provide for periodic bulk item curb collections, and/or collections for motor oil and e-waste. Other cities may not provide any of these services.

Cities may or may not provide all collections containers (trash, recycling, and greenery) as part of the regular collections fees. For any collections services that do not include containers within the collections rate, customers would pay a separate amount for the cost for these containers.

Because these differences in services exist, the City of Chula Vista has represented that the chart provided is a rate survey only; it is not intended to be a services benchmark.

Additionally, the City of San Diego provides weekly trash collection, but only provides recycling and greenery collections every other week. The other cities included in the San Diego County survey provide weekly collections for all three collections services.

Because the City of San Diego provides only biweekly recycling and greenery services, the "Comparison of Refuse Collection Fees within San Diego County" provided by the IBA, has two lines dedicated to the City of San Diego – "San Diego - 'Base Rate'" and the "San Diego - 'Twice the Cost for Recycling/Greenery.'"

The costs included in the "San Diego - 'Twice the Cost for Recycle/Greenery'" line contains twice the budgeted costs for recycling and greenery, in an attempt to compare the costs as if recycling and greenery were picked up every week, instead of bi-weekly. These figures are not an accurate measure of what the true cost would be, but are provided for comparative purposes in the absence of better information. Actual costs would likely not be doubled.

Also, it should be noted that the City of San Diego rates are based on FY10 budget amounts for collections services costs, as no cost of service study has been done to determine an accurate rate. Centralized costs for the Environmental Services Department and City-wide costs have not been included in the estimated rate determination, nor has the estimated savings based on the recent 4/10/5 work schedule/service delivery reorganization.

The "San Diego - 'Base Rate'" line assumes all three collections services are provided to a customer and is based on the FY10 budget amounts for collections services costs:

- Trash - \$34.0 million; 305,000 customers; \$9.29 estimated monthly fee.
- Recycling - \$8.7 million; 257,000 customers; \$2.82 estimated monthly fee.
- Greenery - \$7.0 million; 191,000 customers; \$3.05 estimated monthly fee.

The "San Diego - 'Twice the Cost for Recycle/Greenery'" line uses the same FY10 information, only the cost for recycling and greenery collections is doubled, as explained above:

- Trash - \$34.0 million; 305,000 customers; \$9.29 estimated monthly fee.
- Recycling - \$17.4 million; 257,000 customers; \$5.64 estimated monthly fee.
- Greenery - \$14.0 million; 191,000 customers; \$6.10 estimated monthly fee.

Attachments:

"Solid Waste Rates Survey of the San Diego Region - July 2010," which was prepared by the City of Chula Vista.

"Comparison of Refuse Collection Fees within San Diego County," which has been prepared by the IBA for the Citizens' Revenue Review and Economic Competitiveness Commission

**Solid Waste Rates Survey of the San Diego Region July 2010**

<b>Residential - Single Family Rate Per Month</b>								
<b>City</b>	<b>2009-10 Rates</b>	<b>Comparison Rate is middle rate or majority service level if no middle rate.</b>	<b>2010-11 Rates</b>	<b>Comparison Rate is middle rate or majority service level if no middle rate.</b>	<b>(-)Minus Admin/Other Fee</b>	<b>(-)Minus Franchise Fee</b>	<b>(-)Minus AB 939 Fee</b>	<b>= 2010-11 Adjusted Rates (City Fees Removed)</b>
Carlsbad	\$18.87	\$ 18.87	\$18.87	\$ 18.87	3.46 stormwater .12 admin	\$ 1.06	.28 Ab 939 fee	\$ 13.95
Chula Vista	\$13.01 - 32 gal \$16.86 - 64 gal \$19.83 - 96 gal	\$ 16.86	\$13.01 - 32 gal \$16.86 - 64 gal \$19.83 - 96 gal	\$ 16.86	-	8.0%	5.00%	\$ 14.67
Coronado	17.67	\$ 17.67	17.67	\$ 17.67	-	-	\$ 1.01	\$ 16.66
County					-	\$2.35/ton (\$1.25 to Recycling, \$1.10 to HHW)	\$0.02/ton to be used for countywide AB 939 programs including CIWMP, Siting Element and Summary Plan	
Del Mar	\$18.91	\$ 18.91	\$18.91	\$ 18.91	-	10.0%	-	\$ 17.02
El Cajon	\$20.38	\$ 20.38	\$20.38	\$ 20.38	\$0.50	15.0%	-	\$ 16.90
Encinitas	12.29-35 gal 18.44-95 gal	\$ 18.44	12.29-35 gal 18.44-95 gal	\$ 18.44	-	5.0%	R: \$0.21 per residence; C: varies based upon frequency of service	\$ 17.32
Escondido	\$17.91	\$ 17.91	\$17.91	\$ 17.91	.52 HHW Fee	\$ 1.72	21c per single family residence/month	\$ 15.46
Imperial Beach	22.62 - 35 gal 23.32 - 64 gal 24.11 - 95 gal	\$ 23.32	24.74 - 35 gal 25.51 - 64 gal 26.37 - 95 gal	\$ 25.51		36.0%	-	\$ 16.33
La Mesa	\$18.42	\$ 18.42	\$18.42	\$ 18.42	\$0.11 HHW Fee	4.0%	R: \$0.62; C: \$4.12	\$ 16.98
Lemon Grove	17.93 standard 14.35 Sr. rate 2.79 silver bag	\$ 17.93	17.93 standard 14.35 Sr. rate 2.79 silver bag	\$ 17.93	-	10.0%	R: \$0.19; C: \$0.60	\$ 15.97
National City	\$16.64	\$ 16.64	\$16.64	\$ 16.64	-	9.0%	Not separately stated	\$ 15.14
Oceanside	\$23.21	\$ 23.21	\$23.21	\$ 23.21	\$.64 stormwater fee \$1.59 Service fee, 3.77 City Fee	5% for roll-offs	-	\$ 17.21
Poway	14.73, 23.38	\$ 23.38	14.78, 23.52	\$ 23.52	1.34, 3.65	10.0%	1.20 residential	\$ 16.80
San Diego	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	\$8/ton refuse collector business tax (applied to all non-franchise users of the landfill)	\$15-16/ton	\$10/ton	N/A
San Marcos	\$19.65	\$ 19.65	\$20.39	\$ 20.39	2.18 Storm water	8.0%	\$0.53	\$ 16.27
Santee	\$19.14	\$ 19.14	\$19.14	\$ 19.14	-	10.8%	\$3,333/month (paid quarterly by WMI)	\$ 17.07
Solana Beach	\$21.43	\$ 21.43	\$21.43	\$ 21.43	\$1.82 NPDES	7.5%	-	\$ 18.14
Vista	\$18.61	\$ 18.61	\$18.91	\$ 18.91		6.5%	R: \$0.07/month; C: \$0.63/month on a 3yd bin	\$ 17.62
<b>Adjusted Mean Average</b>	<b>Mean Average</b>	<b>\$ 19.46</b>	<b>Mean Average</b>	<b>\$ 19.66</b>	<b>Adjusted Mean Average</b>			<b>\$ 16.44</b>

CITIZENS' REVENUE REVIEW AND ECONOMIC COMPETITIVENESS COMMISSION  
Comparison of Refuse Collection Fees within San Diego County  
THURSDAY September 9, 2010

Residential - Single Family Rate Per Month			
City	Comparison Rate: is middle rate or majority service level if no middle rate <sup>1</sup>	(-)Minus Stormwater Fee <sup>1</sup>	Difference
Carlsbad	\$ 18.87	\$ 3.46	\$ 15.41
Chula Vista	\$ 16.86	\$ -	\$ 16.86
Coronado	\$ 17.67	\$ -	\$ 17.67
Del Mar	\$ 18.91	\$ -	\$ 18.91
El Cajon	\$ 20.38	\$ -	\$ 20.38
Encinitas	\$ 18.44	\$ -	\$ 18.44
Escondido	\$ 17.91	\$ -	\$ 17.91
Imperial Beach	\$ 25.51	\$ -	\$ 25.51
La Mesa	\$ 18.42	\$ -	\$ 18.42
Lemon Grove	\$ 17.93	\$ -	\$ 17.93
National City	\$ 16.64	\$ -	\$ 16.64
Oceanside	\$ 23.21	\$ 0.64	\$ 22.57
Poway	\$ 23.52	\$ 3.65	\$ 19.87
San Diego - "Base Rate" <sup>2</sup>	\$ 15.16	\$ -	\$ 15.16
San Diego - Twice the Cost for Recycling/Greenery <sup>3</sup>	\$ 21.03		\$ 21.03
San Marcos	\$ 20.39	\$ 2.18	\$ 18.21
Santee	\$ 19.14	\$ -	\$ 19.14
Solana Beach	\$ 21.43	\$ 1.82	\$ 19.61
Vista	\$ 18.91	\$ -	\$ 18.91
<b>Adjusted Mean Average</b>	<b>\$ 19.49</b>		<b>\$ 18.87</b>

This is a rate survey only, it is not intended to be a services benchmark.

**NOTES:**

<sup>1</sup>The amounts in the comparison rate and stormwater fee columns are taken from the "Solid Waste Rates Survey of the San Diego Region - July 2010," which was prepared by the City of Chula Vista.

<sup>2</sup>The "San Diego - 'Base Rate'" line assumes all three collections services are provided to a customer and is based on the FY10 budget amounts for collections services costs:

Trash - \$34.0 million; 305,000 customers; \$9.29 estimated monthly fee.  
Recycling - \$8.7 million; 257,000 customers; \$2.82 estimated monthly fee.  
Greenery - \$7.0 million; 191,000 customers; \$3.05 estimated monthly fee.

<sup>3</sup>The "San Diego - 'Twice the Cost for Recycling/Greenery'" line uses the same FY10 information, only the cost for recycling and greenery collections is doubled:

Trash - \$34.0 million; 305,000 customers; \$9.29 estimated monthly fee.  
Recycling - \$17.4 million; 257,000 customers; \$5.64 estimated monthly fee.  
Greenery - \$14.0 million; 191,000 customers; \$6.10 estimated monthly fee.

It is unlikely that the cost for recycling and greenery collections would double if collections were increased from biweekly to weekly. The doubling of costs is presented for comparative purposes only.